Panacea Journal of Linguistics & Literature (PJLL)



Volume 3, Number 1, 2024, Pages 157 - 169

Journal Home Page



https://journals.airsd.org/index.php/pjll

Challenges in Teaching English at Elementary Schools in Multan: An Analytical Study of Resource Deficiency and Classroom Dynamics

Asia Iobal¹, Fariha Naz² & Tehreen Fatima³

¹Senior Lecturer, Department of English, Institute of Southern Punjab Multan, Multan, Punjab, Pakistan Email:uzairasia2@gmail.com

²Lecturer, Department of English, Institute of Southern Punjab Multan, Multan, Punjab, Pakistan

³M.Phil. Scholar, Department of English, Institute of Southern Punjab Multan, Multan, Punjab, Pakistan

ARTICLE INFO

Al	BS'	TR	RA	CI	[

Article History:		,
		e
Received:	February	28,2024 <i>l</i>
Revised:	March	27,2024
Accepted:	April	30,2024 1
Available Online:	May	25,2024 '
	-	6

Keywords:

English language teaching, elementary education, Language teaching, as both qualitative and quantitative data strongly teachers' challenges

This study investigates the challenges faced by English language teachers at elementary schools. This analytical study employs a mix-method approach. The basic aim of this study is to investigate the challenges faced by English language teachers, to identify the effect of insufficient teaching resources on the effectiveness of English language instruction, to analyze inadequate teacher training, classroom size effect on language learning outcomes, to evaluate the role of stiff curriculum design in shaping language teaching and to assess the effect of student's socio-economic background on their language learning development. Total population including all the male, female, elementary school's teachers are 300 and only 40 teachers were selected randomly. Analysis and Findings identified that insufficient teaching resources (87.5%) and large classroom sizes (80%) are the most significant challenges affecting English

pedagogical strategies, professional development, corroborated these issues. Inadequate teacher training (70%) also emerged as a critical concern, followed by stiff curriculum design (75%) and socio -economic challenges (65%), which, while significant. Overall, resources availability and classroom size were the most heavily weighted variables in the analysis. Longitudinal studies, specific interventions, comparative studies are required for better outcomes in English language teaching.



© 2024 The Authors, Published by AIRSD. This is an Open Access Article under the Creative Common Attribution Non-Commercial 4.0

Corresponding Author's Email: uzairasia2@gmail.com

INTRODUCTION

There are two key variables in this study, independent variables are included teacher qualifications, teaching resources, classroom size, curriculum design, and student socioeconomic background and the dependent variable is the effectiveness of English language teaching.

Although previous researcher focused on ambiguous areas and broadly documented the challenges faced by teachers at several stages of English language teaching challenges. The main purpose of this study is to provide a general view by exporting several variables simultaneously and presenting a more comprehensive understanding of the challenges faced by teachers. There is a note able gap in understanding how these challenges specifically affect elementary level instruction. Moreover, there remains a significant lack of comprehensive knowledge that simultaneously address limited resources, inadequate teacher training, socio-economic issues, large classroom size and stiff curricula. The main object of this study is to fill this gap by providing a holistic analysis of these interrelated challenges and recommending integrative strategies to overcome them. The study applied both qualitative and quantitative techniques to enhance the validity of the findings. Employing consistency in data collection process by means of statistical methods for data analysis, which strengthen the study's validity. The study's findings were limited only on the sample of 40 teachers, who were not the representative of all elementary school teachers. Further, data collection procedure may have favoritisms, particularly in self-reported survey and interviews. The study focuses completely on elementary school teachers, who limited the generalizability of the findings to other educational levels. Moreover, this study is limited to challenges in teaching English, excluding other themes or methods.

Statement of the Problem

Teaching English at the elementary level is troubled with many challenges that hinder the active delivery of instruction and the desired learning results, which can negatively affect student's outcomes. The major challenges faced by teachers are limited resources, inadequate teacher training, socio-economic issues, large classroom size and stiff curricula. These are the main challenges that need the development and application of required strategies and interventions to improve teaching effectiveness and promote language learning skills among learners. Controlling these challenges is required for developing an encouraging environment that support learners.

Research Questions

- 1. What are the challenges faced by English language teachers at Elementary level?
- **2.** What is the effect of insufficient teaching resources on the effectiveness of English language instruction?
- 3. How do teaching resources and classroom size effect on language learning outcomes?
- 4. What is the role of curriculum design in shaping English language teaching?
- **5.** In what ways students' socio-economic background effect students language learning development?

Significance of the Study

This study is significant because it seeks to categorize and analyze the crucial challenges faced by English language teachers at the elementary level and recommend effective strategies to control these challenges. Understanding these challenges and their impact on teaching- learning may inform policy decisions, support teachers training programs, and lead to the expansion of extra effective instructional content and pedagogies. The findings of this study have the potential to improve the quality of English language learners and may inform policy maker and guide in designing decided interventions to direct teachers and recover students learning outcomes.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Smith (2020) founded that the part of instructor's qualifications in influencing students' progress in English, observing that specific training in language instruction is vital. It is acknowledged that higher qualifications were corelated with higher student test scores. He further stated that teachers with well training in language teaching are better equipped to hold several classroom needs, which directly effects student's progress. This finding aligns with earlier studies, highlighting the need for comprehensive and ongoing professional development programs for teachers to improve their instructional skills. According to a survey conducted by the World Bank (2022), vocational training and courses that integrate industry mainly effective in improving the employability of students from poor backgrounds (World Bank, 2022). Sutcher, Darling-Hammond, and Carver-Thomas (2019) claimed that retaining qualified teachers is another major challenge. Schools serving deprived people, undermine struggles to maintain a qualified teaching workforce.

Johnson and Stevens (2019) investigated that limited teaching materials and funds significantly effects instructors' capability to deliver effective instructions. A noteworthy variance in students test score was found between classes with satisfactory and insufficient resources. Johson and Stevens (2019) investigated that insufficient teaching content like outdated textbooks and lack of technology, dangerously stop teacher's skills to conduct effective English lessons so due to these shortage of resources sometime forces teachers to rely on less effective teaching techniques and negatively influences students learning outcomes. Smith and Benavides (2021) founded that poor policy implementation, administrative inefficiencies and corruption prevent resources from reaching the intended beneficiaries. Okeniyi and Ayodele (2019) highlighted that teachers in resources-poor condition sometime practices high levels of stress that can lead to higher turnover rates and a decline in teaching quality. Most of the teachers are incapable to facilitate the necessary support to their students. Moreover, insufficient resources negatively affect teachers moral and effectiveness. Technological disparities and digital divide are noteworthy barrier to learn language, both in rural and urban areas. Due to the gap in resource availability in elementary schools with limited internet access and technological infrastructure both teachers and students are failing to benefit from digital learning resources (Zhao et al., 2022).

Brown and Lee (2021) founded that large classroom sizes decrease students' attention, thus a large number of students affecting language acquisition process and large classroom sizes were related with lower student test scores. They confirmed that teachers in congested classrooms struggle to provide the individual attention needed for language enhancement. Mostly, such type of problem is observed in urban schools where class sizes surpassed optimal numbers, leading to reduced student involvement and lower overall achievement in language learning. According to United Nations (2020) over inhabitants and urbanization are foremost contributes to classroom overcrowding, particularly in big cities. Populations increase and the demand for educational services both go side by side. This situation usually outpacing the available infrastructure and the mispatch between need and demand leads to congested class sizes.

Williams (2022) claimed that individuals from lower socio-economic backgrounds frequently face learning challenges, for example limited experience of listening, speaking, reding and writing English outside the classroom and lack of parents and instructor's guidance. Such factors contribute badly to a significant gap in language acquisition between students from different socio-economic backgrounds and effects student's language learning progress. Garcia and Lee (2021) recommended that inclusive pedagogies such as applying diverse teaching methods, learning styles and materials that reflect the discriminate socio-economic backgrounds of students are very crucial. Further, professional development for teachers on inclusive pedagogy practice can boost validity of course designs.

Jones (2023) viewed about the limitations of stiff and out-of-date curricula that can limit teachers' performance, efficiency and creativity. Additionally, an effective and well design curriculum that integrates language skills with practical applications may boost learners' understanding. A well design curriculum can integrate language performance with practical applications so develop student's achievements and learning outcomes. Brown and Green (2020) are of the opinion that the key challenges in course design is addressing the digital divide and to encounter this teacher must ensure that curse contents are reachable in several formats and that students have approach to required technological resources. Thompson and McIntyre (2023) stated that courses that boos critical thinking, problem-solving, and digital literacy train students with indispensable skills for the up-to-date workforce, in that way expand the socio-economic prospects. Cooperating with local communities and investors can develop the relevance and positive impact on course designs. However, communities-based learning projects can provide students with valuable-real-world experiences, enrich the curriculum and provide resources to supports students from low-income backgrounds (Hernandez & Davis, 2022).

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Current study adopted a mixed-methods approaches, both qualitative and quantitative data collection tools were applied to provide a comprehensive analysis of the challenges faced by elementary school's teachers in teaching English. Data for this study was collected in two parts. This study includes 300 English Language teachers of elementary schools as population and from this total population size only 40 teachers were randomly selected as sample for this study to ensure representation of diverse teaching situations and experiences. Qualitative data were collected through interviews and focus groups from 40 teaches. The statements in interview and focus group were related to expose teachers' experiences, challenges, and insights regarding teaching English. Quantitative data were collected through survey and standardized test scores. The survey comprises questions about teacher's qualifications, access to resources, class size and insight of the curriculum, standardized test scores of their students were also collected to quantity the success of English language instruction.

Data Analysis

Documentation Analysis contains measuring the frequency and context of specific terms applied by teachers during interviews and focus groups. This analysis guides to comprehend the interest and concerns of teachers. Common Terms Identified:

Resources: Frequently indicated in the context of lack and inadequacy.

Training: Frequently indicated with regard to insufficiency and required for enhancement.

Class Size: Emphasized as a significant issue.

Curriculum: signified as stiff and out-of-date.

Socio-Economic: Allied with challenges and barriers faced by students.

Table 1: Frequency	of Key Words/Terms
--------------------	--------------------

Word/Term	Frequency	Context
Resources (comes on 2 ^{nd)}	40	Often mentioned on the context of lack and necessity for effective teaching.
Training	35	Frequently discussed regarding inadequacy and need for professional development.
Class Size	30	Highlighted in discussions about the difficulty of managing large groups.
Curriculum	28	Mentioned in terms of rigidity and lack of flexibility.
Socio-Economic	32	Discussed in relation to external challenges faced by students.

The high frequency of these terms highlights the key concerns of teachers. The Importance of resources and training indicates that these are the most critical areas.

Qualitative Thematic Analysis by Theme

Thematic Analysis was done is to analyze interview and focus group data, identifying main themes and insights. It contains detecting and analyzing themes (patterns) within qualitative data. The present study has performed Thematic Analysis on the interviews and focus group information collected by 40 teachers of elementary schools.

Theme	Frequency	Example Questions	Interpretation
Insufficient Teaching Resources	35	What kind of resources do you have access to for teaching English?	A majority of teachers reported a lack of adequate resources, indicating widespread issue.
Inadequate Teacher Training	30	Do you feel your training adequately prepared you to teach English?	Many teachers felt their training was insufficient, highlighting the need for more specialized training.
Large Classroom Sizes	28	How does classroom size affect your ability to teach	Large classroom sizes were a common concern, suggesting that

 Table 2: Theme, Frequency, Example Questions, and interpretation

		English effectively?	overcrowding impacts teaching quality.
Rigid Curriculum Design	25	How flexible is the curriculum you use for teaching English?	The rigidity of the curriculum was frequently mentioned, indicating the need for a curriculum reform.
Socio-economic Challenges	32	How do students' socio- economic backgrounds affect their English learning?	Socio-economic challenges were significant, showing that students from disadvantaged backgrounds face additional barriers.

The thematic analysis identifies that insufficient resources, inadequate training, large class size, stiff curricula, and socio-economic challenges are dominant problems affecting the efficacy of English language teaching.

Coding and Quantification of Themes

Coding contains identifying segments of data into themes. The researcher coded the interviews and focus group reports into the identified themes. The mean score, frequency, and percentage direct the occurrence and severity of each theme. The t-test indicates that the difference in the themes is statistically significant, indicating their impact on English language teaching. The statistical analysis shows a quantifiable judgement of the themes' prevalence and impact. Higher mean score and frequencies specify more noteworthy challenges in insufficient teaching resources, large classroom sizes, and stiff curriculum design are the most disturbing problems.

Descriptive Statistical Analysis of Qualitative Data:

 Table 3: Coding Themes Quantified by Applying Mean score, Frequency, percentage, and T-test

 Analysis

Theme	Mean Score	Frequency	Percentage	T-value	P-value
Insufficient Teaching Resources	4.2	35	87.5%	2.60	0.01*
Inadequate Teacher Training	3.8	30	75%	2.45	0.02*
Large Classroom Sizes	3.7	28	70%	2.30	0.03*
Rigid Curriculum	3.5	25	62.5%	2.15	0.04*

Design					
Socio- economic Challenges	4.0	32	80%	2.50	0.02*

Inferential statistics and Descriptive Statistics:

Table 4: (t-test analysis) are used to analyze survey and test score data

Theme	Mean Score (1-5)	Standard Deviation	Frequency	Percentage
Insufficient Teaching Resources	4.2	0.8	35	87.5%
Inadequate Teacher Training	3.8	0.9	30	75%
Large Classroom Sizes	3.7	1.0	28	70%
Rigid Curriculum Design	3.5	0.7	25	62.5%
Socio-economic Challenges	4.0	0.8	32	80%

Comparative Analysis of Interview and Focus Groups

 Table 5: Coding into Themes: Similarities and Differences

Theme	Frequency (Interviews)	Frequency (Focus Groups)	Similarities	Differences
Insufficient Teaching Resources	18	17	Both groups highlighted resource shortages.	Interviews focused more on specific materials.
Inadequate Teacher Training	15	13	Training inadequacies were mentioned in both.	Focus groups discussed a need for ongoing training.
Large Classroom Sizes	16	16	Consistent mention of large class sizes.	No significant differences.
Stiff Curriculum Design	14	16	Both groups criticized the curriculum rigidity.	Focus group provided more examples of the need of flexibility.
Socio- economic Challenges	13	14	Socio-economic issues were highlighted similarly.	Interviews had more anecdotal evidence.

FINDINGS

Qualitative Findings

Teachers informed that a lack of sufficient teaching materials and resources are needed. Most of the teachers realized that their training did not effectively prepare them for teaching English. Large class size was considered as a significant obstacle to active teaching. Teacher's complaint that the curriculum is outdate. Students from lower -economic background faced challenges in learning English.

Quantitative Findings

Variable	Mean	Standard Deviation
Insufficient Teaching Resources (1-4)	2.8	0.6
Teacher Training (1-4)	2.3	0.7
Classroom Size (students)	35	5
Student Test Scores (percentile)	65	10

 Table 6: Mean score and Standard Deviation

Interpretation of results

Higher training is correlated with higher students test score. A Noteworthy difference in students score was presented between classes with adequate and inadequate resources. Large classroom size was allied with lower student test scores. The rigidity of the curriculum negatively impacted student test scores. Students from lower socio-economic background had lower test scores. The analysis demonstrate that socio-economic factors significantly affect language learning outcomes.

 Table 8: Comparative and Contrast Analysis of Qualitative and Quantitative Data

Theme	Frequency (Interviews)	Frequency (Focus Groups)	Combined Frequency	Example Response/Insights
Insufficient Teaching Resources	18	17	35	We lack essential materials like updated textbooks and technology for lessons.
Inadequate Teacher Training	15	13	28	The training programs do not adequately prepare us for practical classroom challenges.
Large Classroom Sizes	16	16	32	Managing a class of over 30 students makes it difficult to give individual attention.
Stiff Curriculum Design	14	16	30	The curriculum is too rigid, limiting our ability to address diverse student needs.

Socio-	13	14	27	Students from low-income
economic				families face additional hurdles
Challenges				in their language learning.

Variable	Mean Score (1-5)	Standard Deviation	Frequency	Percentage (%)	t-value	p-value
Insufficient Teaching Resources	4.2	0.8	35	87.5	2.23	0.028*
Inadequate Teacher Training	3.9	0.9	28	70.0	2.01	0.045*
Large Classroom Sizes	4.1	0.7	32	80.0	2.15	0.032*
Stiff Curriculum Design	4.0	0.8	30	75.0	2.11	0.038*
Socio- economic Challenges	3.8	0.9	27	67.5	1.95	0.052*

 Table 9: Quantitative Data Analysis (Survey Results)

Table 10: Comparative Documentation Analysis of Term Applied by Teachers

Word/Term	Frequency	Context	
"Resources"	45	Often mentioned in the context of lack and necessity for effective teaching.	
"Training"	40	Frequently discussed regarding inadequacy and need for professional development.	
"Class Size"	42	Highlighted in discussions about the difficulty of managing large groups.	
"Curriculum"	38	Mentioned in terms of rigidity and lack of flexibility.	
"Socio- Economic"	35	Discussed in relation to external challenges faced by students.	

The high frequency of all these five terms reflects the key themes indicated in the qualitative and quantitative analysis. The situation in which these words or terms are used helps the thematic findings, focusing the importance of addressing these challenges to improve English teaching at the elementary schools.

Corroboration of Findings in Qualitative and Quantitative Techniques

Frequency revealed in both interviews and focus groups (35 mention), with teachers exactly pointing out the lack of updates textbooks and technology. Top mean score of 4.2, signifying a significant concern among teachers. The percentage of 87.5% and t-value of 2.23 (p< 0.05) confirm its statistical significance. Qualitative and Quantitative data both of these strongly identified that insufficient teaching resources are a serious issue. This consistency across data forms recommends that addressing resource deficiency must be a priority for policy and intervention strategies.

Inadequate Teaching Training

Reported by 28 teachers, with mutual themes around inadequate preparation and the need for more practical training. Indicated mean score of 3.9 with a 70% frequency, statistically significant with a t-value of 2.01 (p< 0.05). Both sets of data highlight the inadequacy of teacher training programs, indicating a demand for better and ongoing professional development to well prepare teachers for classroom challenges.

Large Classroom Size

Consistently reported by 32 teachers, emphasizing difficulties in managing large groups and providing individual attention. Mean score of 4.1 with 80% frequency, significant with a t—value of 2.15 (p< 0.05). The problem of large classroom size is consistently identified as a major challenge. The alignment of qualitative insights and quantitative outcomes underscores the importance of addressing class size in language learning reforms.

Curriculum Design

Identified by 30 teachers, who observed that the curriculum, limits their ability to meet various student's learning needs. Mean score of 4.0 with 75% frequency, significant with t—value of 2.11 (p < 0.05). Qualitative and quantitative data both highlight the need for a more informative curriculum that allows teachers to practice instruction to the different needs of their students.

Socio-Economic Challenges

Reported by 27 teachers, highlighting additional obstacles faced by students from low-income families. Mean score of 3.8 with 6.7.5% frequency, nearing significances with a t-value of 1.9.5 (P=0.0.052). Socio-economic challenges are highlighted in both analyses. The quantitative data demonstrations it as less statistically significant compared to other themes. This indicates socio-economic factors are identified but may require more targeted qualitative investigation to fully understand their effect.

Classroom Learning Objectives (CLOs)

- Language Skills: This can recover students' four language learning skills such as listening, speaking, reading, and writing skills in English.
- Communication: Boost students communicate skills.
- Comprehension: Develop students' comprehension skills for better communication.
- Vocabulary: Construct students' vocabulary.

• **Cultural Awareness:** Enhance students' knowledge of English-speaking cultures to offer context for language learning.

Classroom Teaching Objectives:

- **Instructional Strategies:** Implement effective teaching strategies according to students' diverse learning demands.
- **Resource Utilization:** Use accessible resources efficiently to support language instruction.
- **Classroom Management:** Manage classroom large size to facilitate students in a better way.
- **Curriculum Adaptation:** Select effective curriculum to be more informative and approachable to students demands.
- **Student Support:** Offer extra help to students from lower socio-economic backgrounds to ensure reasonable learning chances.

The classroom learning and teaching objectives aim to address the investigated challenges and increase the efficacy of English language instruction at the Nishat elementary schools.

DISCUSSION

English instructors at the Nishat elementary schools are facing challenges like insufficient teaching resources, inadequate training, large classroom size, stiff curriculum design and socio - economic obstacles faced by their students.

Insufficient teaching resources prominently hamper the effectiveness of English language teaching. The insufficiency of updated textbooks, technology, and other important materials restricts teachers' performance to deliver engaging and comprehensive lessons, which directly impacts students learning outcomes. Elementary school's teacher qualification prominently effects the effectiveness of English teaching. Qualified and well-trained teachers are better equipped to handle classroom challenges and adapt their teaching strategies to fulfill students learning requirements.

Suitable teaching resources and controlled classroom sizes are very important for effective language learning. Insufficient resources stop proper lesson conduction. Large classroom size decreases the ability to provide individual attention and depressingly effect students' outcomes.

Curriculum design plays a serious part in English language teaching. An adaptable curriculum directs teachers to address different student's needs and Boost learning outcomes. On the other hand, a stiff curriculum can bound teaching effectiveness.

Students from minor socio-economic backgrounds frequently face some extra challenges for instance restricted exposure to English outside of school, lack of parental guidance and support, and limited learning resources at home. These factors can significantly hamper their language learning growth.

Through Qualitative and Quantitate finding it is clear that insufficient teaching resources, inadequate teacher training, large classroom sizes, and stiff curriculum design are crucial challenges and these consistent with previous researches, like Johonson and Stevens (2019), Brown and Lee (2021) and Simith (2020) in their studies also pointed out these challenges in the

area of elementary schools English teaching. Further researcher is needed on the under-mention points. a) To assess the long-term impact of improved resources, training, and curriculum changes on student outcomes. b) Research into effective strategies for addressing socioeconomic challenges. c) In comparative studies researchers compare findings across diverse regions to classify best practices.

CONCLUSION

The study identifies key challenges in teaching English at elementary level. These challenges are insufficient resources, inadequate teacher training, large class sizes, stiff curricula, and socioeconomic differences. Analysis and Findings highlighted these challenges as insufficient teaching resources (87.5%) and large classroom sizes (80%) are the most significant challenges affecting English Language teaching, as both qualitative and quantitative data strongly corroborated these issues. Inadequate teacher training (70%) also emerged as a critical concern, followed by stiff curriculum design (75%) and socio -economic challenges (65%), which, while significant. Overall, resources availability and classroom size were the most heavily weighted variables in the analysis. Implementing suitable recommendations can improve the effectiveness of English language teaching and increase student learning outcomes. Through aligning useful teaching strategies, teacher training, better resource allocation, controllable class sizes, an informative curriculum, and extra support for students from lower socio-economic backgrounds with objectives, teachers can better solve the challenges investigated in this study and enhance the effectiveness of English language teaching at Elementary schools Multan.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Enhanced Teacher Training must be conducted to implement targeted professional development programs focused on language instruction.
- Resource Provision and adequate teaching materials and technology should be ensured the in schools.
- Decrease class sizes to allow for more student's attention.
- Revising the curriculum to make it more flexible and responsive to individual's requirements.
- Organizing after-school tutoring and parental engagement programs that can cover the challenge of socio-economic pressure and may provide further support for students from lower socio-economic circumstances.

REFERENCES:

- Brown, M., Green, (2020). Bridging the digital divide: Ensuring equitable access to education. *International Journal of Educational Technology*, 11(4), 189-205.
- Brown, L., & Lee, K. (2021). Classroom size and its impact on language acquisition. *Journal of Educational Research*, 34(2). 78-92.
- Garcia, M., & Lee (2021). Professional development for inclusive teaching: Strategies and outcomes. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 65,134-145.

- Hernandez, L., & Davis, (2022). Community-based learning and socio-economic equity in Education. *Journal of Community Engagement and Higher Education*, 14(1),78-92.
- Johnson, M., & Stevens, P. (2019). Resource availability and teaching effectiveness in elementary schools. *Education Today*, 45(3), 112-126.
- Johson, P., & Stevens, R. (2019). Resource allocation in primary education: Impact on English teaching. *Journal of Educational Resources*, 23(2),134-147.
- Jones, A. (2023). Curriculum design in language education. Teaching innovations, 12 (1),45-60.
- Okeniyi, G.A., & Ayodele, B. (2019). Stress, job satisfaction and performance of teachers in resource-limited environments. *Journal of Educational Management*, 11 (2), 150-165.
- Simith, R. (2020). Teacher qualifications and students' achievement in English language learning. *Journal of Economic Education*, 20(2), 55-71.
- Smith, R., & Benavides, M. (2021). Resource allocation in Latin American Schools. Policy challenges and solutions. *International Journal of Educational Policy*, 9 (3), 245-269.
- Sutcher, L., Darling-Hammond, L., & Carver-Thomas, D. (2019). Understanding Teacher Shortages: An Analysis of Teacher Supply and Demand in the United States. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 27(35), 1-40.
- Thompson, P., & McIntyre, S (2023). Long-term socio-economic benefits of skill-based Education. *Journal of Economic Education*, 24(1), 98-115.
- Williams, T. (2022). Socio-economic disparities in education: A Case Study of English Learners. Journal of Social Issues in Education, 28(1), 98-112.
- World Bank, (2022). Vocational Training and Employability: A Global perspective. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Zhao, Y., Wang, L., & Chen, Q. (2022). The digital divide and its impact on educational equity:
 A global perspective. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 70(30), 5
 67- 585.